

**To: The Clerk
The Lothian and Borders Fire and Rescue Board**

**REPORT TO THE LOTHIAN AND BORDERS
FIRE AND RESCUE BOARD**

REPORT NO. 18/05

**SUBJECT: MAKING SAFER COMMUNITIES: SERVICE IMPROVEMENT
PLAN 2005-2010: CONSULTATION ANALYSIS REPORT**

INTRODUCTION

The Fire (Scotland) Act came into effect on 2 August, 2005.

Section 40 of the Act requires Scottish Ministers to prepare a document setting out priorities, objectives and guidance for Fire and Rescue Authorities in connection with the carrying out of their functions. This document, the Fire and Rescue Framework for Scotland, came into force on 6 October, 2005.

The Framework confirmed the requirement on Fire and Rescue Authorities to produce integrated risk management plans. (Chapter 4, paragraph 4-9)

The Improvement Plan approved by the Board for consultation on June 24th 2005 is based upon the guidance and direction issued to Fire and Rescue Authorities by the Scottish Executive in respect of integrated risk management plans.

The purpose of this report is to provide the Fire and Rescue Board with details of the consultation methods used and the extent of responses received. A report is being compiled which will provide a detailed analysis of the responses submitted.

BACKGROUND

On June 24th 2005 the Lothian and Borders Fire Board agreed the Service Improvement Plan for consultation.

The Plan was formally launched on 1 August, 2005 inviting views and comments on its content. 1800 copies of the Plan and 75,000 leaflets were distributed. A range of interest groups were identified as key stakeholders and these formed the basis for the distribution of the Plan:

Constituent Councils
Scottish Executive
MSP's, MP's, MEP's
Trade Unions including STUC
Justice Department
HMFSI
Community Planning Partnerships

Community Safety Partnerships
Equality and Diversity Groups
Community Councils
Internal stakeholders
General public

Responses from the limited consultation on the earlier IRMP 2005/2006 are also included in this analysis.

CONSULTATION METHODS

As well as being available on the Fire and Rescue Service's website at www.lbfire.org.uk, 1800 printed copies of the Plan and 75,000 leaflets were distributed to internal and external stakeholders. A full list of those consulted is shown at Appendix A and includes;

- 5 Constituent Councils
- 5 Community Planning Partnerships
- 5 Community Safety Partnerships
- 162 Community Councils
- Scottish and neighbouring Fire and Rescue Services
- Scottish Executive
- HMFSI
- MP's, MSP's and MEP's
- Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA)
- Chief Fire Officers' Association (CFOA)
- Fire Brigades Union (FBU)
- Unison

Internal Consultation

All 1250 employees of Lothian and Borders Fire and Rescue Service were consulted via the Service Intranet, through memoranda, letters, briefing notes and via articles and features in the Service magazine. Copies of the Plan were sent to;

- 52 Wholetime Watches
- 26 Retained Stations
- 4 Fire Control Watches
- 10 Functions and Functional Areas
- 59 Managers including 11 Station Commanders
- 11 Community Safety Firefighters
- Scottish International Fire Training School
- Trade Unions

Copies were also available in the Service library.

Four seminars took place, attended by 158 Firefighters, Watch and Crew Managers, along with 22 smaller meetings attended by 60 Retained employees and 248 Wholetime staff across the Lothian and Borders area. Any pertinent issues raised at

these meetings were captured and will be carried into the full evaluation of consultation responses.

Public Consultation

Advertisements were taken out in the following newspapers and publications:

Herald and Post
Lothian Times
Midlothian Advertiser
Evening News
Herald and Post
South Edinburgh Echo
North Edinburgh News
Edinburgh Times
The Leither
Corstorphine News
The Speaker
West Lothian Courier
Linlithgow Journal & Gazette
The Berwick Gazette
Berwickshire News
Selkirk Weekend Advertiser
Southern Reporter
Hawick News
Berwick Advertiser
Peebles Times
East Lothian Herald
Musselburgh News
East Lothian News
Edinburgh A-Z of Council services

Many articles and features were carried by these publications and others, such as the Midlothian News. The proposals have also been debated through the letters pages of local newspapers.

Press releases were sent out and the proposals contained in the Plan were featured on local and national radio and television.

Copies of the Plan and leaflets were sent to 125 Doctors surgeries and 68 Libraries across the Lothian and Borders area. Leaflets were also distributed through community centres, council offices and other public buildings.

Meetings and presentations between Lothian and Borders Fire and Rescue Service Senior Management and various Interest Groups were carried out on request. 19 external meetings and presentations took place and are listed in Appendix B. These included four public meetings in Restalrig, Melrose, Livingston and Tranent. All pertinent issues raised at these meetings were captured and will be carried into the full evaluation of consultation responses.

RESPONSES

The consultation period ended on 31 October, 2005 and written or emailed responses were received from 2289 organisations and individuals. These are broken down as follows:

Responses concerning the whole Plan		8
Responses concerning Edinburgh		34
Responses concerning West Lothian		19
Responses concerning East Lothian		4
Responses concerning Midlothian		1
Responses concerning the Scottish Borders	Personal responses	118
	Standard letters x 18 variations	2105
Total – all areas/responses		2289

Table 1 provides a breakdown of the number of responses by interest group;

Interest Group	Number of responses received
Constituent Councils	3
Councillors	10
MSP's, MP's, MEP's	10
Scottish Executive	0
Trade Unions (inc. STUC)	3
Justice Department	0
HMFSI	1
Community Planning Partnerships	0
Community Safety Partnerships	0
Equality and Diversity Groups	0
Community Councils	2
Internal stakeholders	9
Others groups/ Individuals	2251

Petitions

Nine petitions from localities affected by some of the service improvement proposals were also submitted, along with 48 slips from a campaign run by the Border Telegraph newspaper concerning Melrose Fire Station. Table 2 below shows the subject and size of each petition. A number of the signatories were from outwith the Service area and the impact of this will be evaluated at the next reporting stage.

Edinburgh Petition	“Save Marionville Fire Station”	Contact – Ewan Aitken	172 names
Edinburgh Petition	“Concerns regarding the proposal to close Marionville Fire Station which is of great importance to our safety and security. The proposal should not go forward.”	Phyllis Herriot – Chairperson Moira Park Sheltered Housing Tenant’s Association	948 names
Edinburgh Petition	“Do not want Marionville Fire Station closed.”	None	186 names
Edinburgh Petition	“Object to the closure of Marionville Fire Station on the grounds of the increased response time and therefore greater risk to local Restalrig /Lochend /Mountcastle/Northfield/Willowbrae communities.”	None	1282 names
Edinburgh Petition	“Stop the closure of Marionville Fire Station because of the effect it will have on the community and the North East of Edinburgh.”	T.A.R.G.E.T. (Tenants Association Restalrig getting Everyone Together) - Kenny Boorman	1473 names
East Lothian Petition	“Are you in favour of keeping Tranent Fire Station open?”	East Lothian Liberal Democrats	195
East Lothian Petition	“Stop the closure of Tranent Fire Station We the citizens of --- <u>Do Not</u> want the above to close.” Tranent		3381

	Prestonpans Macmerry Pentcaitland Longniddry Port Seton Elphinstone Ormiston Musselburgh Gorebridge Dalkeith Haddington Dunbar Cockenzie Wallyford Aberlady Edinburgh Total		235 160 112 71 63 83 35 3 1 1 2 2 1 5 1 12 4168 names
West Lothian Petition	<p>“We object to the proposed reforms to our local Fire Service. In particular we oppose the proposals to reduce fire cover at Livingston Fire Station (which is the main station serving Livingston, East Calder, Kirknewton and Uphall) from 2 full time appliances, 24 hours each day, to 1 full time and 1 retained appliance from 5pm until 9am, and at weekends. We assert that this reduction in fire cover will put an increased risk on the lives of both residents and firefighters and so demand that the present full time fire appliances be retained at Livingston.”</p>	Fire Reforms Action Group	3596 names
Scottish Borders Petition	<p>“We wish to register our opposition to the proposed closure of our local fire station. We believe that the closure of our local fire station will be detrimental to fire safety and wish to register our opposition to any such plans.”</p>	Melrose Fire Station crew	10,127 names
Campaign slips	<p>“We wish Melrose Fire Station to remain open.”</p>	Respondents to Border Telegraph newspaper campaign	48

FINDINGS

The comments and issues raised by the respondents to this consultation will be evaluated in detail and compared to the proposals contained in the Plan. The results of this evaluation will be brought to a future meeting of the Lothian and Borders Fire and Rescue Board.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Board is recommended to note the extent of the consultation process that was carried out for the Service Improvement Plan 2005/2010 and the quantity of responses returned.

BRIAN ALLAWAY
Chief Fire Officer

November 2005

**LOTHIAN AND BORDERS FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE
SERVICE IMPROVEMENT PLAN 2005/2010**

**External and Internal Consultation
Consultees**

Age Concern Scotland
Arson Prevention Bureau
Association of British Insurers
Audit Scotland
Building Research Establishment
Capability Scotland
Commission for Racial Equality
Community Councils per Community Council Listings for Lothian and Borders area.
Community Planning Partnerships Partners
Community Safety Partnership Partners
Constituent Authorities
COSLA
Council Emergency Planning Officers
Disability Rights Commission
Edinburgh and Lothian Racial Equality Council
Equal Opportunities Commission
Federation of Small Businesses
Fire Brigades Union – Scotland
Fire Protection Association
Fire Service Research Training Trust
General public – via distribution of copies of the Plan and leaflets
General public - via press and other advertising
General public – via public meetings
Health & Safety Executive
Help the Aged
HMFSI (Scotland)
Institute of Directors
Internal and External audiences – via Intranet and Internet Sites
LAPS Partners
LBFRS Staff
LBFRS Employee Representatives
Libraries throughout the Lothian and Borders area
Local Business and Commercial Interests
Local Health Boards
Lothian and Borders Police
Mountain and Search and Rescue Teams
MSP's MP's and MEP's
Neighbouring Fire and Rescue Services
Scottish Ambulance Service
Scottish Chambers of Commerce
Scottish Disability Equality Forum

Scottish Executive Key Stakeholders -including The Minister for Justice and the
Minister for Finance and Public Service Reform
Scottish Fire and Rescue Services
Scottish Environmental Protection Agency (SEPA)
Society of Local Authority Chief Executives and Senior Managers (SOLACE)
STUC
UNISON

**LOTHIAN AND BORDERS FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE
SERVICE IMPROVEMENT PLAN 2005/2010**

External Consultation Meetings

Attendees	Date	Venue
Councillors from East Lothian, John Home-Robertson MSP, Ann Moffat MP Retained Firefighters, Wholetime Firefighters	Wednesday 17 th August	Tranent Civic Centre
Public Meeting: Chaired by Councillor Ewan Aitken	Wednesday 24 th August	YWCA, Restalrig Road South
Queensferry & District Community Council	Monday 29 th August	Council Office , High Street, South Queensferry
City of Edinburgh Council and Community Councils	Friday 2 nd September	Council Chambers, CEC
Members of the Policy, Partnership and Resources Committee, West Lothian Council	Tuesday 13 th September 2005	Chambers, West Lothian House
Public Meeting: Chaired by William Windram, Provost and Chair of the Community Council	Tuesday 13 th September	Corn Exchange, Melrose
Scottish Borders Council	Thursday 15 th September	Council Headquarters, Newtown St Boswells
West Lothian Community Planning Partnership	Thursday 6 th October	West Lothian House, Emergency Planning Room
Public Meeting: Chaired by Councillor Maureen Child	Monday 10 th October	Portobello Town Hall
Public Meeting: Chaired by Councillor Ian Perry	Thursday 13 th October	Royal High Primary School

Public Meeting: Fire Reform Action Group (West Lothian) Councillor Peter Johnston SNP Group Leader	Monday 17 th October	Inveralmond Community High School, Ladywell
Midlothian Council	Tuesday 18 th October	Midlothian House
Members of the Policy, Partnership and Resources Committee, West Lothian Council	Tuesday 25 th October	Chambers, West Lothian House
Public Meeting: Chaired by East Lothian Liberal Democrats	Tuesday 25 th October	Loch Centre, Loch Road, Tranent
Scottish Borders New Ways Forum	Thursday 27 th October	Council Headquarters, Newtown St Boswells
Presentation to Susan Deacon MSP	Friday 28 th October	Constituency Office
Edinburgh Community Safety Partnership Executive	Wednesday 2 nd November	City Chambers, CEC
Lothian & Borders Emergency Steering Committee	Thursday 24 th November	Scottish Borders Council